



Universitat de Lleida

Document downloaded from:

<http://hdl.handle.net/10459.1/59754>

The final publication is available at:

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pestbp.2017.03.001>

Copyright

cc-by-nc-nd, (c) Elsevier, 2017



Està subjecte a una llicència de [Reconeixement-NoComercial-SenseObraDerivada 4.0 de Creative Commons](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39

Target-site and Non-target-site resistance mechanisms to ALS inhibiting herbicides in *Papaver rhoeas*

Jordi Rey-Caballero^a, Julio Menéndez^b, Maria D. Osuna^c, Marisa Salas^d, Joel Torra^{a*}

* Correspondence to: Joel Torra Farré, Department D'Hortofructicultura, Botànica i Jardineria, Agrotecnio, Universitat de Lleida, Alcalde Rovira Roure 191, Lleida, Spain. E-mail: joel@hbj.udl.cat

^aDepartment d'Hortofructicultura, Botànica i Jardineria, Agrotecnio, Universitat de Lleida, Alcalde Rovira Roure 191, Lleida, Spain

^bDepartamento de Ciencias Agroforestales, Escuela Politécnica Superior, Campus Universitario de La Rábida, 21071 Palos de la Frontera, Huelva, Spain.

^c“Finca La Orden-Valdesequera” Research Centre, Ctra. A-V, Km372, 06187 Guadajira Badajoz, Spain.

^dDuPont de Nemours, Reu Delarivière Lefoullon, La Defense Cedex, Paris 92064, France

40 **Abstract**

41 Target-site and non-target-site resistance mechanisms to ALS inhibitors were
42 investigated in multiple resistant (tribenuron-methyl and 2,4-D) and only 2,4-D
43 resistant, Spanish corn poppy populations. Six amino-acid replacements at the Pro197
44 position (Ala197, Arg197, His197, Leu197, Thr197 and Ser197) were found in three
45 multiple resistant populations. These replacements were responsible for the high
46 tribenuron-methyl resistance response, and some of them, especially Thr197 and
47 Ser197, elucidated the cross-resistant pattern for imazamox and florasulam,
48 respectively. Mutations outside of the conserved regions of the ALS gene (Gly427 and
49 Leu648) were identified, but not related to resistance response. Higher mobility of
50 labeled tribenuron-methyl in plants with multiple resistance was, however, similar to
51 plants with only 2,4-D resistance, indicating the presence of non-target-site resistance
52 mechanisms (NTSR). Metabolism studies confirmed the presence of a hydroxy
53 imazamox metabolite in one of the populations. Lack of correlation between phenotype
54 and genotype in plants treated with florasulam or imazamox, non-mutated plants
55 surviving imazamox, tribenuron-methyl translocation patterns and the presence of
56 enhanced metabolism revealed signs of the presence of NTSR mechanisms to ALS
57 inhibitors in this species. On this basis, selection pressure with ALS non-SU inhibitors
58 bears the risk of promoting the evolution of NTSR mechanisms in corn poppy.

59

60 **Keywords:** enhanced metabolism, genotype, mutation, phenotype, synthetic auxins,
61 translocation pattern.

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76 1. Introduction

77

78 *Acetohydroxy acid synthase* (AHAS, EC 4.1.3.18), also referred to as acetolactate
79 synthase (ALS, EC2.2.1.6), is the first enzyme involved in the biosynthesis of branched
80 chain amino-acids valine, leucine and isoleucine [1,2]. This enzyme is the target site of
81 five herbicide chemical groups: sulfonylureas (SU), imidazolinones (IMI),
82 triazolopyrimidines (TP), pyrimidinyl-thiobenzoates (PTB) and sulfonyl-
83 aminocarbonyl-triazolinones (SCT). These herbicides, commonly referred to as ALS
84 inhibiting herbicides, are highly effective at a low rate and environmentally safe [2].
85 Only five years after the introduction of the first SU, resistant biotypes *Lactuca serriola*
86 L. [3] and *Kochia scoparia* L. [4] were reported. To date, 155 species in locations all
87 over the world (94 dicots and 61 monocots) have evolved resistance to ALS inhibitors
88 [5].

89 The SU and IMI herbicides are not competitive inhibitors of ALS because they do
90 not directly bind to the substrate's active site. Instead, these herbicides bind within the
91 substrate-access channel of the ALS enzyme in plants. In this way, both herbicides
92 inhibit ALS by blocking substrate access to the active site. It is well documented that
93 SU are better ALS inhibitors than IMI because SU fit better (more hydrogen bonds are
94 involved) and deeper into the channel (closer to the active site) [2]. In most cases,
95 resistance to ALS inhibitors is caused by mutation of the ALS gene, which results in the
96 change of a single amino-acid residue in the herbicide-binding site (Target-site
97 resistance, TSR) [6]. Thus far, 28 amino-acid substitutions endowing ALS inhibitors
98 resistance have been reported, mainly at the Pro197 site (Ala, Arg, Asn, Gln, His, Ile,
99 Leu, Lys, Met, Ser, Thr, Trp and Tyr), and also at Ala122 (Thr, Tyr and Val), Ala205
100 (Val), Asp376 (Glu), Trp574 (Arg, Leu, Gly and Met), Ser653 (Asn, Ile and Thr) and
101 Gly654 (Glu and Asp) in resistant weed species [5,7]. There is a wide variation in the
102 resistant response among species with a given substitution [7]. Moreover, ALS-
103 inhibitors cross-resistance is also dependent on specific mutations, chemical groups,
104 specific herbicides within a given group, and sometimes even weed species [8].
105 Generally, a high level of resistance is conferred by Pro197 substitutions to SU and by
106 Trp574 substitutions to all classes of ALS inhibitors. A second mechanism of resistance
107 to ALS inhibitors is to reduce the amount of herbicide reaching ALS to be below the
108 lethal level (Non-target-site resistance, NTSR). Reduced absorption and translocation
109 rarely underlay resistance to ALS inhibitors [9-12], and in only a few cases have they
110 been reported as a partial resistance mechanism [13, 14]. On the other hand, an
111 enhanced herbicide metabolism rate has been proposed for several species, such as
112 *Lolium rigidum* L. [15], *Sinapis arvensis* L. [9] and *Echinochola phyllopogon* L. [16].

113 An amalgam of different factors has been proposed to contribute to the number of
114 ALS inhibitor-resistant cases. Additionally, the repeated use of these herbicides is an
115 most important aspect [6], though genetic, molecular and physiological biology of this
116 resistance must also be considered. High mutation rates in ALS genes of some species
117 account for the relatively high frequency of resistant alleles to ALS inhibitors in natural
118 populations [17, 18]. Moreover, resistant ALS alleles are dominant over susceptible
119 alleles and because ALS is a nuclear gene, resistant alleles are disseminated by both

120 pollen and seed [6]. Studied resistant species have not shown any fitness cost associated
121 to the most common mutations of the ALS gene (Pro197 and Trp574) [19-21]. For this
122 reason, it has been considered that these resistant characteristics will persist in the
123 populations and not decline with the time [8].

124 *Papaver rhoeas* L. (corn poppy) is the most common dicotyledonous weed in winter
125 cereals in southern Europe [22]; it is an annual, diploid species that is insect-pollinated
126 and self-incompatible [23]. In recent years, corn poppy with multiple resistance to 2,4-D
127 and tribenuron-methyl has been reported in Spain [24] and Italy [20], and independent
128 resistance to ALS inhibitors has evolved in a number of other countries across Europe
129 (Belgium, Denmark, France, Germany, Greece, Poland, Sweden and United Kingdom)
130 [5]. In Spain, the resistance to tribenuron-methyl is conferred by Pro197 to Ser
131 substitutions [25]. In addition, irregular responses to other ALS inhibitors (mainly IMI
132 and TP) have been reported in post-emergence field applications. Recently, the presence
133 of NTSR mechanisms in Italian corn poppy has been shown because plants resistant to
134 imazamox, but not carrying mutant ALS alleles, were identified [26]. These resistance
135 mechanisms, genes involved and how they affect the different ALS inhibitor
136 chemistries still needs to be uncovered.

137 The objectives of this study were (1) determine, with dose-response experiments, the
138 herbicide rate causing 50% mortality (GR_{50}) and the resistance index (RI) of resistant
139 (R) and a susceptible (S) populations, primarily to ALS inhibitors (tribenuron-methyl,
140 florasulam and imazamox), and secondarily to 2,4-D; (2) sequence the ALS gene from
141 these corn poppy populations in order to identify potential mutations; (3) compare the
142 genotype with the phenotype of individual plants in order to establish a relationship
143 between the molecular results and the ALS inhibitors response; (4) study tribenuron-
144 methyl absorption and translocation patterns; and (5) determine the presence of
145 enhanced metabolism to imazamox to unveil potential NTSR mechanisms contributing
146 to the resistance response of these corn poppy populations.

147

148

149 **2. Materials and methods**

150 *2.1 Plant material*

151

152 Before winter cereal harvest, mature corn poppy capsules were collected from four
153 fields where corn poppy control with ALS inhibitors and/or 2,4-D had been reported as
154 a failure. In addition, seeds from two susceptible (S) populations were obtained; one
155 was provided by a seed dealer (Herbiseed, Twyford, UK) and the other was collected
156 from the same region where suspicious resistant populations were collected. Further
157 details regarding these populations are summarized in Table 1. Corn poppy seeds
158 previously sterilized in a 30% hypochlorite solution were sown in Petri dishes with
159 1.4% agar supplemented with 0.2% KNO_3 and 0.02% gibberellin GA_3 . Seeds were
160 placed in a growth chamber at 20/10 °C day/night, a 16 h photoperiod under 350 μ mol
161 photosynthetic photon-flux density $m^{-2} s^{-1}$. After 14 days, seedlings were transplanted in
162 7 × 7 × 7 cm plastic pots filled with a silty loam:sand:peat (40% w/v, 20% w/v, 40%
163 w/v) potting mix. Pots were placed in a greenhouse in Lleida, Spain (41°37'43.1"N -

164 0°35'52.6"E) and were watered and fertilized as needed. All plants produced in this
165 manner were employed in the subsequent experiments.

166

167 *2.2 Dose-response assays*

168

169 Five seedlings were sown per pot and after sprouting, they were thinned to three per
170 pot. At the six leaf stage (a 5-6 cm rosette), plants were sprayed with tribenuron-methyl,
171 florasulam, imazamox or 2,4-D at a range of herbicide rates (rates are detailed in Table
172 2). Four replicates (pots) were applied with each herbicide rate. Herbicides were applied
173 using a precision bench sprayer with two Hardi ISO LD-110-02 flat fan 110° opening
174 nozzles operating at a forward speed of 0.9 ms⁻¹, 50 cm above plants, 200 l ha⁻¹, and at
175 a pressure of 215 kPa. Four weeks after treatment, plants were harvested (above
176 ground). Samples were dried at 65 °C for 48h, and the dry weights were measured.
177 Finally, weight reduction was calculated as a percentage of the untreated control for
178 each population. Experiments were repeated twice.

179

180 *2.3 DNA extraction, ALS gene sequencing and restriction analysis*

181

182 In another experiment, at the six leaf stage, a total of fifty-one plants per population
183 (255 overall) were sprayed with tribenuron-methyl, florasulam or imazamox (seventeen
184 plants for each product) at the recommended field rate. Plants from the S-012
185 population were not included in this experiment, but results from unpublished work did
186 not detect any mutation among thirty plants. The herbicide was applied as described
187 above. One week before application, a leaf fragment (~100 mg) from each plant was
188 taken and frozen for subsequent molecular analyses. Four weeks after treatment,
189 individual plant responses were evaluated. Dead plants were classified as susceptible
190 (S). Plants re-growing from the center of the rosette were classified as moderately
191 resistant (r) and plants that were unaffected by herbicide were classified as resistant (R)
192 (Fig. 1). DNA from the leaf fragment was extracted using the Speedtools Plant DNA
193 Extraction Kit (Biotools B&M Labs S.A., Valle de Tobalina, Madrid, Spain) and the
194 DNA sample concentration was measured in a NANODROP Thermoscientific
195 spectrophotometer (ThermoFisher, Nano- Drop Products, Wilmington, DE). Each DNA
196 sample was diluted to a final concentration of 10 ng/μl, which was immediately used for
197 the polymerase chain reaction (PCR) test or stored at -20°C until use.

198 Mutations conferring ALS resistance in corn poppy at Pro197 and Trp574 codons
199 were analysed first for all the samples. Fragments of the ALS gene that included the
200 regions of those codons were amplified using corn poppy primers described in a
201 previous work [27]. The amplification was accomplished following the procedures
202 described in the above mentioned work [27]. PCR amplification products were
203 separated in a 1.5% agarose gel. Gels were then observed under ultraviolet light (320
204 nm; ALPHA DIGI DOC Pro instrument, Alpha Innotec Corporation, Johannesburg,
205 South Africa) and images recorded with gel photography. Amplified DNA fragments
206 were purified using the Speed tools PCR Clean-Up Kit (Biotools, B&M Labs, Madrid,
207 Spain), then sequenced. Restriction analysis were conducted to define double-peaks

208 detected in the sequence chromatograms. For this analysis, primers and procedures were
209 utilized as described by Kaloumenos *et al.* [27]. The resulting electrophoresis bands
210 were visualized under UV light after being stained with GelRed (Biptium, California,
211 USA). The digestion profile for each population was compared with its respective, non-
212 digested control profile as well as the S-control digestion profile. Haplotype inference
213 was determined by comparing sequences obtained from the other samples within the
214 same population. In some specific cases where the same genotype at Pro197 codon
215 expressed different responses to the same herbicide, other positions related to ALS
216 resistance were examined (Ala122 ,Pro197, Ala205, Asp376, Trp574, Ala653 and
217 Gly654). Methodology for this part was conducted as described in a previous work [23].

218

219 *2.4 Tribenuron-methyl absorption and translocation experiment*

220

221 [¹⁴C]-tribenuron-methyl ([¹⁴C]-Tri) with a specific activity of 1.422 MBq/mmol
222 (Institute of Isotopes Co. Ltd. Budapest, Hungary) was mixed with commercial
223 formulated tribenuron-methyl in distilled water up to a final concentration of 0.093 g L⁻¹
224 (18.7 g a.i.·ha⁻¹ dissolved into 200 L ha⁻¹ of distilled water). Four 0.5 μL droplets of
225 this mixture were applied per plant to the adaxial surface of the fourth leaf at the six true
226 leaf stage of development (a 5-6 cm rosette). Every plant received a radioactivity of
227 166.5 MBq mmol⁻¹. Five repetition (considering every plant as a repetition) from each
228 population were harvested at 12, 24, 48, and 96 h after treatment (HAT). Unabsorbed
229 [¹⁴C]-Tri was rinsed from the treated leaves of each plant using 2 ml of an acetone and
230 water (1:1 v/v) solution. The rinse of each replication was mixed with 15 mL
231 scintillation fluid (UltimaGoldTM, Perkin-Elmer, Packard Bioscience BV), and analyzed
232 by liquid scintillation spectrometry (LSS) (Beckman LS 6000 TA scintillation counter;
233 Beckman Instruments, CA, USA). Washed plants were separated into treated leaf,
234 shoots and root, dried at 70°C for 48 h and parts were combusted in a sample oxidizer
235 (OX 500; R. J. Harvey Instrument, Tappan, NY, USA). The radioactivity of the
236 resulting [¹⁴C]-CO₂ was determined by LSS. Foliar absorption (%) was calculated as:
237 (Radioactivity recovered from plant parts) / (Total radioactivity recovered) x 100.
238 Translocation (%) was calculated as: (Absorbed radioactivity in treated leaf, shoot or
239 root) / (Absorbed radioactivity in all tissues) x 100. Percentage or recovery was always
240 greater than 80%.

241 To assess translocation of [14C]-Tri, two treated plants for S-013, R-703 and R-213
242 populations were removed from pots 96 HAT. Roots were rinsed and whole plants were
243 dried (65 °C for 48 h) and pressed against a 25 by 12.5–cm phosphor storage film
244 (PerkinElmer Life and Analytical Sciences, Shelton, CT) for 6 h, and scanned using a
245 phosphor imager (Cyclone, Perkin-Elmer, Packard Bioscience BV).

246

247 *2.5 Imazamox metabolism studies*

248

249 The methodology followed was described by Rojano-Delgado *et al.* [28]. Application
250 of imazamox was performed as dose–response assays with a relative volume of 200 L
251 Ha⁻¹ and with a dose of imazamox at 100 g ai Ha⁻¹ (corresponding to two times the

252 average dose used in field) as well as a 0 dose (control). Plants treated with herbicide
253 and the controls were cut 0, 24, 48 and 72 h after application and stored at $-40\text{ }^{\circ}\text{C}$ until
254 use. The frozen samples were washed with 60 mL of water to remove traces of
255 imazamox and soil on the leaf surface, before the extraction. They were ground to a fine
256 powder using liquid nitrogen in a porcelain mortar. One-half gram of each sample was
257 mixed with 10 mL in proportion 90:10 (v/v) methanol–water and ultrasonicate at 70 W
258 during 10 min (duty cycle 0.7 s s^{-1}). Then it was centrifugated (15 min at 20,000 rpm)
259 to separate the solid residue. 6 mL of this extract was taken and evaporated to dryness
260 under an air stream and later, reconstituted by 0.5 mL of extractant (90:10 methanol–
261 water) and filtered through a nylon filter syringe (45 μm pore size and 13 mm i.d. from
262 Millipore, Carrigtwohill, Ireland) before chromatographic analysis.

263 Imazamox and metabolites were determined by the liquid chromatography–DAD
264 (diode array detector analysis) at a measurement wavelength of 240 nm. A Gold HPLC
265 (High-performance liquid chromatography) System from Beckman Coulter (Fullerton,
266 USA) equipped with a 26 System Gold Diode Array detector (wavelength range 190–
267 600 nm) was used in this case. A hydrophilic interaction liquid chromatography column
268 (20 cm x 4.6 cm, 3 μm particle size) was used for the separation of the metabolites and
269 herbicide. 50 μL of the reconstituted phase was injected into the liquid chromatography
270 with 1 % (v/v) acetic acid in water as mobile phase A and pure methanol as mobile
271 phase B. The elution program started with 5 % mobile phase B and followed the linear
272 gradient: step 1, 5 to 20 % methanol in 10 min; step 2, 20 to 80 % methanol in 10 min;
273 step 3, 80 to 100 % methanol in 5 min; and step 4, 100 to 5 % methanol in 10 min. The
274 constant flow rate and column temperature were 1.0 mL min^{-1} and $40\text{ }^{\circ}\text{C}$, respectively.
275 Chromatographic peaks in the liquid chromatography–diode array detector were
276 assigned according to retention times using as a reference the imazamox peak identified
277 by spiking extracts with the commercial standard. Quantification of imazamox
278 metabolites was based on the calibration model for imazamox, and the results were
279 expressed as micrograms (μg) of the analyte equivalent to imazamox per gram (g^{-1}) of
280 plant. Liquid chromatography–DAD was performed by using two plants per sample
281 (three repetitions) and four populations (S-013, R-213, R-313 and R-703). Finally,
282 mutations conferring ALS resistance in corn poppy at Pro197 and Trp574 codons were
283 analysed for plants used at 72 HAT, six per population, as described above.

284

285 2.6 Statistical analysis

286

287 For the dose-response experiment, statistical analysis were carried out with a
288 nonlinear regression model with the *drc* [29] package in R [30]. The herbicide rate
289 causing 50% of plant growth reduction (GR_{50}) was calculated via four parameter
290 logistic curves:

$$291 \quad y = c + \frac{(d-c)}{1+\text{EXP}[b(\log(x)-\log(\text{GR}_{50}))]} \quad (1)$$

292

293 Where c = the lower limit, d = the upper limit and b = the slope at the GR_{50} . In this
294 regression equation, the herbicide rate (g a.i. ha^{-1}) was the independent variable (x) and

295 the dry weight (percentage of the untreated control for each population) was the
296 dependent variable (y). The resistance index (RI) was computed as $GR_{50}(R)/GR_{50}(S)$.
297 Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was conducted with [^{14}C]-Tri percentages and
298 imazamox quantities. Data were transformed as needed ($\arcsin[\sqrt{(x+0.5)}]$) when normal
299 assumptions were not met. Population means from each evaluation time were compared
300 using a post-hoc Tukey's pairwise test [30], at $P = 0.05$. Data were then back
301 transformed for their presentation.

302

303 **3. Results**

304 *3.1 Dose-response experiments*

305

306 R-213, R-313 and R-114 plants were 286-, 695- and 351-fold more resistant to
307 tribenuron-methyl than susceptible plants (Table 3, Fig. 2). The R-703 population
308 displayed a very small resistant index (RI) to tribenuron-methyl Florasulam GR_{50} was
309 0.16 g a.i. ha^{-1} in S-013 plants; this parameter was increased 24-fold in R-213 plants
310 (3.90 g a.i. ha^{-1}) and 18-fold in both R-313 and R-114 populations (2.90 and 2.92 g a.i.
311 ha^{-1} respectively). R-703 plants were two times more resistant to florasulam than H-
312 S013 plants The GR_{50} value for imazamox in the susceptible population (S-013) was
313 0.61 g a.i. ha^{-1} . This parameter was 30 (18.08 g a.i. ha^{-1}), 40 (24.37 g a.i. ha^{-1}) and 24
314 (14.73 g a.i. ha^{-1}) times greater in R-213, R-313 and R-114 populations, respectively. R-
315 703 plant results exposed them to be 6 times more resistant (a GR_{50} value of 4.05 g a.i.
316 ha^{-1}) to imazamox than the susceptible biotype. Dose-response experiments conducted
317 with 2,4-D revealed that all populations were resistant to 2,4-D, their RI's ranging from
318 12 to 18 (Table 3, Fig. 2). Minimal differences in the responses of the two S population
319 responses were observed for the different tested herbicides.

320

321 *3.2 ALS sequencing*

322

323 No substitutions at codon Pro197 were found in S-013 plants. However, six amino-
324 acid replacements were identified at this position (Ala197, Arg197, His197, Leu197,
325 Ser197 and Thr197) in populations R-213, R-313 and R-114. Only one plant out of
326 fifty-one in population R-703 presented a substitution (Thr197). Six different genotypes
327 were identified in R-213 (Table 4), with 76% of the plants being classified as
328 homozygous mutant (RR), 24% heterozygous mutant (RS), and 0% wild type (SS). In
329 R-313, twelve different genotypes were detected, 76%, 20% and 4% of these plants
330 were RR, RS and SS, respectively. Finally, eight different genotypes were observed in
331 R-114 plants, 61% of the plants belonging to this population were characterised as RR,
332 25% as RS and 14% as SS (Table 4).

333 Results obtained by the multiple resistant populations (R-213, R-313 and R-114),
334 revealed that all plants carrying at least one mutant ALS allele showed a R response to
335 tribenuron-methyl treatments. The majority of the plants assayed with imazamox were
336 classified as R or r. Most of the imazamox R plants carried at least one Thr197 or
337 Leu197 allele. Few plants treated with florasulam were R, most of them were r or S.
338 The majority of the plants which did not survive florasulam application had a Thr197

339 substitution (Pro/Pro genotype not included), and all plants with R response to this
340 herbicide carried at least one Ser197 allele (Table 4). No mutant plants were found in
341 the S-013 population and no survivors were found for either the tribenuron-methyl or
342 florasulam applications, nevertheless only one plant survived the imazamox application
343 (r). All plants in the R-703 population died when they were sprayed with tribenuron-
344 methyl or florasulam, however, five plants survived imazamox (r). Only one plant
345 presented a substitution (Thr/Thr) at position 197 (Table 4).

346 Some plants identically genotyped (carrying the same number of copies of one given
347 mutant ALS allele) at Pro197 codon displayed different responses to florasulam or
348 imazamox (Table 5). Moderate imazamox resistance (r) and susceptible (S) responses
349 from S-013 and R-703 populations did not show any difference at the other studied
350 positions (Table 5). Samples 25 and 26 from the population R-114 were r and R
351 (respectively) to imazamox and both plants carried a Leu/Thr substitution at position
352 197. Additionally, these plants displayed a heterozygous mutation at position 427
353 (Glu/Lys) and only sample 26 also carried a heterozygous mutation at position 648
354 (Leu/Ser). Samples 20 and 17 from population R-114 showed a Thr homozygous
355 mutation at position 197, but r (sample 20) and S (sample 17) responses to florasulam
356 were observed. Apart from this, both plants also carried a homozygous mutation at
357 position 427 (Lys/Lys) (Table 5).

358

359 3.3 [¹⁴C]-tribenuron-methyl experiments

360

361 There were no differences in [¹⁴C]-Tri absorption patterns between corn poppy
362 populations (Fig. 3). In addition, there were not significant time-related differences in
363 terms of [¹⁴C]-Tri absorption among all the populations tested, with percentages ranging
364 from 24.3% (at 12 HAT) to 37.8 % (at 96 HAT) of the recovered radioactivity (Fig. 3).
365 There were differences in [¹⁴C]-Tri translocation between populations starting 48 HAT,
366 with a maximum at 96 HAT, where they were statistically significant (Fig. 3). While
367 radioactivity in susceptible plants remained asymptotic, radioactivity evaluated in the
368 treated leaf of R-213, R-313, R-114 and R-703 decreased. Therefore, at 96 HAT the
369 percentage of [¹⁴C]-Tri found in the treated leaf of the S plants was 70.9%, which was
370 statistically different from the rates obtained for the rest of populations. The lowest
371 amount of radioactivity in a treated leaf at 96 HAT was detected in R-313 plants (27.6%
372 of the penetrated radioactivity), while [¹⁴C]-Tri for R-213, R-114 and R-703 plants
373 ranged from 45.4 to 49.3% (Fig. 3). These data were consistent with those observed in
374 the shoot, where significant differences were only detected at 96 HAT. R-313 plants
375 translocated almost 3-fold more [¹⁴C]-Tri to the shoots (68.9%) than S-013 plants
376 (25.6%). Radioactivity detected in R-213, R-114 and R-703 shoots at the same
377 evaluation time was 46.8, 49.1 and 51.2%, respectively (Fig. 3). No differences between
378 populations in terms of herbicide translocation to roots were detected at any evaluation
379 time, thus radioactivity evaluated in this part was negligible (Fig. 3). Percentages of
380 recovered radioactivity ranged from 80 to 88% in the S-013 population, from 85 to
381 99%, from 80 to 85%, from 77 to 97% and from 80 to 86% in R-213, R-313, R-114 and

382 R-703 populations, respectively (data not show). Images obtained from the qualitative
383 studies at 96 HAT confirmed the above results (Fig. 4).

384

385 *3.4 Imazamox metabolism studies*

386

387 The imazamox metabolic pattern was different between the S and the R corn poppy
388 populations at 48 and 72 HAT (Table 6). At both sampling times, significantly more
389 herbicide was detected in the S population. At 72 HAT, the R-313 population had
390 significantly the lowest amount of herbicide in the aerial part of the plants. Imazamox
391 was only detected in roots in the S population at 48 HAT, while at 72 HAT the amount
392 was significantly much higher compared to R ones. The liquid chromatography-DAD
393 revealed the presence of a hydroxy metabolite of imazamox (at 17 min in the
394 chromatogram, Supplementary Material) in the aerial part and roots in one of the R
395 populations, R-313, at 72 HAT (Table 6). The amount of the metabolite was much
396 higher in aboveground part of the plants. For plants sampled at 72 HAT, ALS gene
397 sequence revealed only wild type genotypes at Pro197 codon in the susceptible (S-013)
398 and the synthetic auxin resistant (R-703) populations. In multiple resistant populations,
399 four Ser/Ser and two Pro/Ser mutants were found in R-313, and three Ser/Ser, one
400 Pro/Ser and one Thr/Pro. None had an aminoacid change at Thr574 codon.

401

402 **4. Discussion**

403

404 Multiple resistance to ALS inhibiting herbicides and 2,4-D was detected in R-213, R-
405 313 and R-114 corn poppy populations. GR₅₀ values for these products were consistent
406 with those reported in Greek ALS resistant and multiple resistant corn poppy
407 populations [32]. As observed in previous studies [33], the degree of resistance varied
408 among ALS inhibitors, resistant factors being much lower for florasulam and imazamox
409 than for tribenuron-methyl.

410 In this study, six amino-acid replacements at the Pro197 position have been found
411 (Ala197, Arg197, His197, Leu197, Thr197 and Ser197); the first five replacements
412 being new for Spanish corn poppy populations, and consistent with previously
413 published European works [23, 27, 34]. The strong resistance to tribenuron-methyl
414 showed by any kind of substitution at Pro197 is because Pro197 amino-acid residue is
415 directly involved in anchoring the aromatic ring of SU. Any replacement in this position
416 will affect SU binding, resulting in strong resistance to this herbicide [2, 35]. Cross-
417 resistance patterns between ALS inhibitors depends on both the codon mutated and the
418 specific amino-acid replaced at the codon [36]. Due to this, different substitutions at
419 Pro197 can give strong, moderate, or no resistance among IMI and TP. In concordance
420 with results in another study [23], corn poppy plants carrying the Thr197 substitution
421 were resistant or moderately resistant to imazamox. Although Pro197 is not involved in
422 binding IMI [37], certain substitutions of these amino-acid residues may result in IMI
423 resistance because the replacement of Pro by a bulky amino-acid obstructs the entry of
424 IMI into the ALS tunnel [2]. Regarding TP, results of this work show that the

425 substitution of Pro197 by Ser lead to plants that were moderately cross-resistant to
426 florasulam, as observed by Délye *et al.* [23].

427 The overuse of tribenuron-methyl during the early 80's in Spanish fields, probably
428 selected a wide variety of Pro197 substitutions in corn poppy. Consecutive ALS
429 herbicide management practices in each field contributed to the reduction, or not, of
430 ALS genotype diversity, depending on which ALS herbicide families were
431 predominantly used. This case is clearly apparent in R-213 plants continuously treated
432 with florasulam + 2,4-D in recent years, as this population has the highest florasulam
433 resistant index, together with the highest Ser allele frequency reported.

434 Plants carrying a double mutation at positions Pro197 and Gly427 (by Lys), and a
435 triple mutation at positions Pro197, Gly427 and Leu648 (by Ser), were detected in this
436 study. Results from a previous work conducted with ALS resistant corn poppy from
437 Spain also detected a point mutation located outside the conserved domains: a
438 replacement of Gly281 by Glu [25]. However, plants carrying these mutations
439 displayed different responses to the same herbicide. Therefore no implication of these
440 two new mutations in resistance response was assumed, awaiting further confirmation.

441 In this research, plants with the same genotype at ALS did not always show the same
442 phenotype when they were treated with florasulam or imazamox. Analogous results
443 were reported in ALS inhibitors resistant *Raphanus raphanistrum* L. and *P. rhoeas* [26,
444 34]. Délye *et al.* [23] and Scarabel *et al.* [26] demonstrated that a NTSR to ALS
445 inhibitors, yet to be determined, could be behind the mismatch between the genotype
446 and phenotype. Moreover, five plants without any mutation were able to survive
447 imazamox application among all populations. In other weeds, NTSR mechanisms
448 (metabolism related) were assumed to be present by identifying sensitive ALS in plants
449 with resistant phenotypes [8, 26, 38]..

450 As observed in corn poppy, no differences in absorption between resistant and
451 susceptible biotypes were also reported in other studies conducted with ALS inhibitors
452 [10, 12, 14, 39]. The novel data in this work come from the experiments conducted with
453 [¹⁴C]-Tri, detecting more translocation in resistant than in susceptible plants, towards
454 other organs and tissues, including the meristems where ALS inhibitors exert most of
455 their action. Hyper-accumulation of carbohydrates in susceptible *Pisum sativum* L.
456 leaves treated with ALS inhibitors has been reported [40], suggesting that ALS
457 inhibitors affect the transport of assimilates into the phloem [41]. On these bases,
458 perhaps this is the explanation for lower [¹⁴C]-Tri translocation in susceptible plants.
459 However, as differences in translocation were observed from 48 hours after treatment
460 on, this is most likely due to differences in metabolism between susceptible plants that
461 were severely affected by the herbicide and resistant plants that were much less
462 affected. Finally, in agreement with previous studies [10], minimum [¹⁴C]-Tri root
463 translocation was detected in the corn poppy roots of all populations.

464 The [¹⁴C]-Tri translocation pattern in R-703 plants resulted controversial because it
465 was similar to those observed for ALS resistant populations (R-213 and R-114). What
466 marked R-703 plants different from the other populations was that these plants were
467 only resistant to 2,4-D. Only one plant out of 57 in this research, and out of 106 in
468 further analyses (unpublished data), presented a mutation in the Pro197 position). Data

469 suggested that tribenuron-methyl phytotoxicity in R-703 plants was not evolving as
470 susceptible plants (S-013), almost during the 96 hours following the herbicide
471 application. Moreover, four plants without any mutation that survived the imazamox
472 application had baffling results for R-703.

473 Metabolism studies with imazamox demonstrated the presence of a hydroxy
474 metabolite, at least in one of the studied populations, R-313, with multiple resistance to
475 ALS inhibitors and synthetic auxins. This is the first direct evidence of the presence of a
476 NTSR mechanism in corn poppy, due to enhanced metabolism of an ALS inhibitor,
477 which has been detected in very few dicot weed species from *Brassicaceae* family
478 [9][42]. Metabolites were not detected in the other populations probably because
479 enhanced metabolism was not high enough due to plant size or short evaluation times.
480 For example, susceptible population was moving a significant imazamox amount to
481 roots while almost none was detected in the other populations. Moreover, it is important
482 to notice that the R-313 population showing enhanced metabolism at 72 HAT also had
483 the significant highest [¹⁴C]-Tri transport to shoots at that evaluation time. Therefore,
484 the presence of NTSR mechanisms through enhanced herbicide metabolism, may
485 explain not only [¹⁴C]-Tri translocation patterns in this population, but translocation
486 patterns in the R-703 population (only synthetic auxin resistant), and that some plants
487 survived imazamox treatments being Pro/Pro for the ALS gene. Moreover, ALS gene
488 sequencing demonstrated that TSR and NTSR mechanisms can be found in the same
489 plants in R-313 population. However, it is impossible to disentangle if NTSR
490 mechanisms for ALS inhibitors are directly related to 2,4-D resistance, the other way
491 round or both.

492

493 **5. Conclusions**

494

495 In this study, three populations were multiple resistant while one population was only
496 resistant to synthetic auxins. Substitutions at Pro197 endowed for a high resistance
497 response to tribenuron-methyl, and moderate or no resistance to other non-SU ALS
498 inhibitors. Non-target-site resistance mechanisms affecting sulfonylurea herbicides did
499 not become evident under the strong resistance conferred by any amino-acid
500 substitution at Pro197 to this chemical group. However, tribenuron-methyl translocation
501 patterns in multiple resistant and only 2,4-D resistant populations suggested the
502 presence of NTSR mechanisms. For non-SU ALS inhibitors, the presence of these
503 NTSR mechanisms became more evident, as plants with the same genotype did not
504 express the same phenotype. This was especially true for the IMI imazamox, where
505 non-mutated plants were able to survive its application. Moreover, metabolism studies
506 with imazamox confirmed the presence of enhanced metabolism at least in one *Papaver*
507 *rhoeas* population for the first time. Therefore, selection pressure with ALS non-SU
508 inhibitors has the risk to promote the evolution of NTSR mechanisms in corn poppy s. It
509 is unknown if those mechanisms affect other modes of action, which are crucial for the
510 management of herbicide resistance. The results exposed in this work will help in the
511 development of future experiments aimed at disentangling the relationship between the

512 ALS inhibitors and the synthetic auxins resistant response, and to deepen in the NTSR
513 mechanisms to both modes of action.

514

515

516 **Acknowledgements**

517

518 The authors gratefully acknowledge Du Pont for funding the experiments. They
519 thank J.S. Notter, Y. Romano, E. Edo and D. Camacho for their help in trials. Special
520 thanks to A.M. Rojano-Delgado for performing the metabolism experiments.

521

522

523 **References**

524 [1] B. Singh, G. Schmitt, M. Lillis, J.M. Hand, R. Misra, Overexpression of
525 Acetohydroxyacid Synthase from Arabidopsis as an Inducible Fusion Protein in
526 *Escherichia coli*: Production of Polyclonal Antibodies, and Immunological
527 Characterization of the Enzyme. *Plant Physiol.* 97 (1991) 657–62.

528 [2] R.G. Duggleby, J.A. McCourt, L.W. Guddat, Structure and mechanism of
529 inhibition of plant acetohydroxyacid synthase. *Plant Physiol. Biochem.* 46 (2008)
530 309–24.

531 [3] C.A. Mallory-Smith, D.C. Thill, M.J. Dial, Identification of sulfonylurea
532 herbicide-resistant prickly lettuce (*Lactuca serriola*). *Weed Technol.* 4 (1990)
533 163–8.

534 [4] M.M. Primiani, J.C. Cotterman, L.L. Saari, Resistance of *Kochia scoparia* to
535 sulfonylurea and imidazolinone herbicides. *Weed Technol.* 4 (1990) 169–72.

536 [5] I. Heap, International Survey of Herbicide Resistant Weeds. [Online].
537 Available:<http://www.weedscience.org/In.asp> [20 Sept 2015].

538 [6] P.J. Tranel, T.R. Wright, Resistance of weeds to ALS-inhibiting herbicides : what
539 have we learned?. *Weed Sci.* 50 (2002) 700–712.

540 [7] H.J. Beckie, F.J. Tardif, Herbicide cross resistance in weeds. *Crop Prot.* 35
541 (2012) 15-28.

542 [8] Q. Yu, S.B. Powles, Resistance to AHAS inhibitor herbicides: current
543 understanding. *Pest Manag. Sci.* 70 (2014) 1340–1350.

544 [9] L.J. Veldhuis, L.M. Hall, J.T. O'Donovan, W. Dyer, J.C. Hall, Metabolism-based
545 resistance of a wild mustard (*Sinapis arvensis* L.) biotype to ethametsulfuron-
546 methyl. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 48 (2000) 2986–2990.

547 [10] H. Cruz-Hipolito, J. Rosario, G. Ioli, M.D. Osuna, R.J. Smeda, F. González-
548 Torralva, et al., Resistance mechanism to tribenuron-methyl in white mustard
549 (*Sinapis alba*) from southern Spain. *Weed Sci.* 61 (2013) 341–347.

550 [11] D.H. Poston, J. Wu, H.P. Wilson, Enhanced sensitivity to cloransulam-methyl in
551 imidazolinone-resistant smooth pigweed. *Weed Sci.* 49 (2001) 711–716.

- 552 [12] H. Cruz-Hipolito, M.D. Osuna, A. Vidal, R. De Prado, Resistance mechanism to
553 bensulfuron-methyl in biotypes of *Scirpus mucronatus* L. collected in Chilean
554 rice fields. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 57 (2009) 4273–4278.
- 555 [13] A.D. White, M.D.K. Owen, R.G. Hartzler, J. Cardina, Common sunflower
556 resistance to acetolactate synthase-inhibiting herbicides. *Weed Sci.* 50 (2002)
557 432–437.
- 558 [14] D.S. Riar, J.K. Norsworthy, V. Srivastava, V. Nandula, J.A. Bond, R.C. Scott,
559 Physiological and molecular basis of acetolactate synthase-inhibiting herbicide
560 resistance in barnyardgrass (*Echinochloa crus-galli*). *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 61
561 (2013) 278–89.
- 562 [15] J.T. Christopher, S.B. Powles, D.R. Liljegren, J.A.M. Holtum, Cross-resistance
563 to herbicides in annual ryegrass (*Lolium rigidum*). *Plant Physiol.* 95 (1991)
564 1036–43.
- 565 [16] H. Yasuor, M.D. Osuna, A. Ortiz, N.E. Saldain, J.W. Eckert, A.J. Fischer,
566 Mechanism of resistance to penoxsulam in late watergrass [*Echinochloa*
567 *phyllopogon* (stapf) koss.]. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 57 (2009) 3653–60.
- 568 [17] C. Preston, S.B. Powles, Evolution of herbicide resistance in weeds: initial
569 frequency of target site-based resistance to acetolactate synthase-inhibiting
570 herbicides in *Lolium rigidum*. *Heredity* 88 (2002) 8–13.
- 571 [18] C.T. Harms, J.J. DiMaio, S.M. Jayne, L.A. Middlesteadt, D.V. Negrotto, H.
572 Thompson-Taylor, et al., Primisulfuron herbicide-resistant tobacco plants: mutant
573 selection in vitro by adventitious shoot formation from cultured leaf discs. *Plant*
574 *Sci.* 79 (1991) 77–85.
- 575 [19] Q. Yu, H. Han, M.M. Vila-Aiub, S.B. Powles. AHAS herbicide resistance
576 endowing mutations: Effect on AHAS functionality and plant growth. *J. Exp.*
577 *Bot.* 61 (2010) 3925–34.
- 578 [20] A. Légère, F.C. Stevenson, H.J. Beckie, S.I. Warwick, E.N. Johnson, B.
579 Hrynewich, et al., Growth characterization of kochia (*Kochia scoparia*) with
580 substitutions at Pro197 or Trp574 conferring resistance to Acetolactate synthase–
581 inhibiting herbicides. *Weed Sci.* 61 (2013) 267–76.
- 582 [21] M. Li, Q. Yu, H. Han, M.M. Vila-Aiub, S.B. Powles, ALS herbicide resistance
583 mutations in *Raphanus raphanistrum*: evaluation of pleiotropic effects on
584 vegetative growth and ALS activity. *Pest Manag. Sci.* 69 (2013) 689–95.
- 585 [22] J. Torra, A. Royo-Esnal, J. Recasens, Management of herbicide-resistant *Papaver*
586 *rhoeas* in dry land cereal fields. *Agron. Sustain. Dev.* 31 (2011) 483–90.
- 587 [23] C. Délye, F. Pernin, L. Scarabel, Evolution and diversity of the mechanisms
588 endowing resistance to herbicides inhibiting acetolactate-synthase (ALS) in corn
589 poppy (*Papaver rhoeas* L.). *Plant Sci.* 180 (2011) 333–42.

- 590 [24] J. Rey-Caballero, J. Menéndez, J. Giné-Bordonaba, M. Salas, R. Alcántara, J.
591 Torra, Unravelling the resistance mechanisms to 2,4-D (2,4-
592 dichlorophenoxyacetic acid) in corn poppy (*Papaver rhoeas*). Pestic. Biochem.
593 Physiol. (2016), <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pestbp.2016.03.002>.
- 594 [25] M. Durán-Prado, M.D. Osuna, R. De Prado, A.R. Franco, Molecular basis of
595 resistance to sulfonylureas in *Papaver rhoeas*. Pestic. Biochem. Physiol. 79
596 (2004) 10–17.
- 597 [26] L. Scarabel, F. Pernin, C. Délye, Occurrence, genetic control and evolution of
598 non-target-site based resistance to herbicides inhibiting acetolactate synthase
599 (ALS) in the dicot weed *Papaver rhoeas*. Plant Sci. 238 (2015) 158–169.
- 600 [27] N.S. Kaloumenos, C.A. Dordas, G.C. Diamantidis, I.G. Eleftherohorinos,
601 Multiple Pro197 substitutions in the acetolactate synthase of corn poppy
602 (*Papaver rhoeas*) confer resistance to tribenuron. Weed Sci. 57 (2009) 362–8.
- 603 [28] A.M. Rojano-Delgado, F. Priego-Capote, R. de Prado, M.D. Luque de Castro,
604 Ultrasound-assisted Extraction with LC–TOF/MS Identification and LC–UV
605 Determination of Imazamox and its Metabolites in Leaves of Wheat Plants.
606 Phytochem. Anal. 25 (2014) 357–363.
- 607 [29] S.Z. Knezevic, J.C. Streibig, C. Ritz, Utilizing R Software Package for Dose-
608 Response Studies: The Concept and Data Analysis. Weed Technol. 21 (2007)
609 840–8.
- 610 [30] R: a Language and Environment for Statistical Computing Development Core
611 Team. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria (2013).
612 Available: <http://www.R-project.org> [10 January 2013].
- 613 [31] T. Hothorn, F. Bretz, P. Westfall, Simultaneous Inference in General Parametric
614 Models. Biometrical J. 50 (2008) 346–363.
- 615 [32] V. Kati, E. Chatzaki, V. Le Core, C. Délye, *Papaver rhoeas* plants with multiple
616 resistance to synthetic auxins and ALS inhibitors, in Proceedings of the
617 Herbicide Resistance in Europe: Challenges, Opportunities and Threats. EWRS -
618 Herbicide Resistant Working Group, Frankfurt am Main, Germany, pp. 24
619 (2014).
- 620 [33] N.S. Kaloumenos, V.N. Adamouli, C.A. Dordas, I.G. Eleftherohorinos, Corn
621 poppy (*Papaver rhoeas*) cross-resistance to ALS-inhibiting herbicides. Pest
622 Manag. Sci. 67 (2011) 574–85.
- 623 [34] R. Marshall, R. Hull, S.R. Moss, Target site resistance to ALS inhibiting
624 herbicides in *Papaver rhoeas* and *Stellaria media* biotypes from the UK. Weed
625 Res. 50 (2010) 621–30.
- 626 [35] J.L. Shane-Friesen, Identification of the mechanisms of wild radish herbicide
627 resistance to psII inhibitors , auxinics and AHLS inhibitors. PhD dissertation.
628 University of Western Australia, Australia (2007).

- 629 [36] H. Han, Q. Yu, E. Purba, M. Li, M. Walsh, S. Friesen S, et al., A novel amino
630 acid substitution Ala-122-Tyr in ALS confers high-level and broad resistance
631 across ALS-inhibiting herbicides. *Pest Manag. Sci.* 68 (2012) 1164–70.
- 632 [37] R.G. Duggleby, S.S. Pang, H. Yu, L.W. Guddat, Systematic characterization of
633 mutations in yeast acetohydroxyacid synthase: Interpretation of herbicide-
634 resistance data. *Eur. J. Biochem.* 270 (2003) 2895–904.
- 635 [38] Q. Yu, I. Abdallah, H. Han, M. Owen, S.B. Powles, Distinct non-target site
636 mechanisms endow resistance to glyphosate, ACCase and ALS-inhibiting
637 herbicides in multiple herbicide-resistant *Lolium rigidum*. *Planta* 230 (2009)
638 713–23.
- 639 [39] N. Dimeo, L.J. Veldhuis, M. Walsh, J.C. Hall, Investigation of MCPA (4-Chloro-
640 2-ethylphenoxyacetate) resistance in wild radish (*Raphanus raphanistrum* L.). *J.*
641 *Agric. Food Chem.* 61 (2013) 12516–12521.
- 642 [40] A. Zabalza, L. Orcaray, S. Gaston, M. Royuela, Carbohydrate accumulation in
643 leaves of plants treated with the herbicide chlorsulfuron or imazethapyr is due to
644 a decrease in sink strength. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 52 (2004) 7601–6.
- 645 [41] H.D. Bestman, M.D. Devine, W.H. Born, Herbicide chlorsulfuron decreases
646 assimilate transport out of treated leaves of field pennycress (*Thlaspi arvense* L.)
647 seedlings. *Plant Physiol.* 93 (1990) 1441–8.
- 648 [42] Z.M. Hatami, J. Gherekhloo, A.M. Rojano-Delgado, M.D. Osuna, R. Alcántara,
649 P. Fernández, H.R. Sadeghipour, R. De Prado, Multiple Mechanisms Increase
650 Levels of Resistance in *Rapistrum rugosum* to ALS Herbicides. *Front. Plant Sci.*
651 7 (2016) 169.
- 652
- 653
- 654
- 655
- 656
- 657
- 658
- 659
- 660

661

662 Table1. Location and date of collection of corn poppy (*Papaver rhoeas*) populations
663 used in the experiments.

664

Code	Location	Sampling location		Year collected	Herbicide management in the field during preceding years
		Latitude	Longitude		
S-013	--	--	--	2008	Susceptible standard population obtained from Herbiseed (Herbiseed, Twyford, UK).
S-012	Belorado (Burgos)	42°24'57.8"N	3°10'49.3"W	2013	Susceptible standard population collected in a non-treated zone, far from fields.
R-213	Baldomar (Lleida)	41°54'39.0"N	1°00'21.2"E	2013	Florasulam plus 2,4-D in post-emergence.
R-313	Tosantos (Burgos)	42°24'43.7"N	3°14'39.9"W	2013	Aminopirialid plus florasulam, bifenoX plus isoproturon and bromoxinil plus ioxinil plus MCPP in post and early post-emergence.
R-114	SantAntolí (Lleida)	41°37'58.4"N	1°19'44.6"E	2014	Iodosulfuron-methyl plus mesosulfuron-methyl and florasulam plus 2,4-D in post-emergence.
R-703	Almacelles (Lleida)	41°43'39.6"N	0°27'29.5"E	2003	Reported 2,4-D control failure in previous years.

665

666

667

668

669

670

671

672

673

674

675

676

677

678

679

680

681

682

683 Table 2. Herbicide used in dose-response experiments and alternative herbicide
 684 treatments.
 685

Herbicide active ingredient.	Commercial product	Field rate(g a.i.·ha ⁻¹)	Manufacture	Dose rate used (g a.i.·ha ⁻¹)
Tribenuron-methyl	Granstar 50 SX	18.7	DuPont	<i>R</i> 1200, 600, 150, 75, 37.5, 18.7, 9.3, 4.6 and 0
				<i>S</i> 18.7, 9.3, 4.6, 2.3, 1.1, 0.5, 0.25 and 0
Florasulam	Nikos	7.5	Dow AgrosiencesIberica	<i>R</i> 480, 240, 60, 15, 7.5, 3.7, 1.8, 0.9 and 0
				<i>S</i> 7.5, 3.7, 1.8, 0.9, 0.4, 0.2, 0.1 and 0
Imazamox	Pulsar 40	50	BASF España	<i>R</i> 3200, 1600, 400, 100, 50, 25, 12.5, 6.2 and 0
				<i>S</i> 50, 25, 12.5, 6.2, 3.1, 1.5, 0.7 and 0
2,4-D	Esteron 60	600	Dow AgrosiencesIberica	<i>R</i> 4800, 1200, 600, 300, 150, 75 and 0
				<i>S</i> 600, 300, 150, 75, 37.5, 18.7, 9.3 and 0

686
 687
 688
 689
 690
 691
 692
 693
 694
 695
 696
 697
 698
 699
 700
 701
 702
 703
 704
 705
 706
 707
 708
 709
 710
 711
 712
 713
 714
 715
 716
 717
 718
 719

720

721 Table 3. Equation parameter of the log-logistic model used to estimate the GR₅₀ of
 722 tribenuron-methyl, florasulam, imazamox and 2,4-D in S-013, S-012, R-213, R-313, R-
 723 114 and R-703 populations of corn poppy (*Papaver rhoeas*).

724

725

Biotype	GR ₅₀ ± SE (g a.i.·ha ⁻¹) ^a	b ± SE ^b	Res SS ^c	RI ^d
Tribenuron-metil				
S-013	0.1 ± 0.0	0.5 ± 0.1	5171	--
S-012	0.1 ± 0.0	0.6 ± 0.2	2689	0.6
R-213	25 ± 6.4	0.6 ± 0.1	10084	286
R-313	61 ± 12	0.6 ± 0.1	22189	695
R-114	31 ± 8.1	0.6 ± 0.1	10609	351
R-703	0.2 ± 0.0	0.5 ± 0.1	328	2
Florasulam				
S-013	0.2 ± 0.0	0.7 ± 0.1	21738	--
S-012	0.4 ± 0.1	0.9 ± 0.2	8530	2
R-213	3.9 ± 0.4	2.0 ± 0.4	3899	24
R-313	2.9 ± 0.7	0.6 ± 0.1	2311	18
R-114	2.9 ± 0.3	0.9 ± 0.1	1529	18
R-703	0.4 ± 0.1	1.3 ± 0.4	1704	2
Imazamox				
S-013	0.6 ± 0.1	0.8 ± 0.2	8917	--
S-012	0.2 ± 0.1	0.4 ± 0.1	2428	0.5
R-213	18 ± 1.0	4.3 ± 1.2	4534	30
R-313	24 ± 3.5	1.8 ± 0.4	6544	40
R-114	15 ± 1.0	1.2 ± 0.1	966	24
R-703	4 ± 0.6	1.5 ± 0.3	1098	6
2,4-D				
S-013	69 ± 10	1.1 ± 0.2	23693	--
S-012	71 ± 24	0.8 ± 0.2	10303	1
R-213	817 ± 96	1.3 ± 0.2	2872	12
R-313	1238 ± 436	0.8 ± 0.3	18435	18
R-114	926 ± 156	1.0 ± 0.3	5038	13
R-703	1040 ± 402	0.7 ± 0.2	8399	15

726

727 ^aGR₅₀, herbicide concentration for 50% reduction of corn poppy dry weight.

728 ^bSlope at the GR₅₀

729 ^cRes SS, residual sum of square.

730 ^dRI (resistance index) = GR₅₀(Population) ÷ GR₅₀(S-013).

731

732

733

734

735 Table 4. Herbicide sensitivity to three ALS inhibitors applied at the field rate and ALS alleles identified (first column) at position 197 in five
 736 different corn poppy (*Papaver rhoeas*) populations (three multiple resistant, one synthetic auxin resistant and one susceptible). No mutations
 737 were found in position Trp574. Numbers represent sum of plants of a particular genotype with a particular phenotypic response to each herbicide
 738 applied.

739

	^a R-213						R-313						R-114						R-703				S-013				
	^b Tri		Flo		Ima		Tri		Flo		Ima		Tri		Flo		Ima		Tri		Flo		Ima				
	^c R	R	r	S	R	r	R	r	S	R	r	S	R	S	R	r	S	R	r	S	S	r	S	S	S	r	S
Pro/Pro									1			1		3			3			17	17	4	12	17	17	1	16
Ala/Pro						1																					
Leu/Leu	2		3		2	1		1																			
Leu/Pro			1		1																						
Ser/Ser	3	3			2	2	2						2		1	1			1								
Ser/Pro	8	1		1			2				2		3			1			1								
Ser/Arg							1																				
Thr/Thr							3	5		1			5			1	1	3				1					
Thr/Pro							2		1	2	1		1			1	2	3	1								
Ser/Thr							4	6	1	5	3		2			3	1	1	2								
Ser/Leu	4	1	7		6	2	1								1												
Thr/His							1																				
Thr/Leu													1				1	3	2								
Thr/Arg									2	1	1																
Leu/Arg						1																					

740

741 ^a Corn poppy population.

742 ^b Herbicide applied, tribenuron-methyl (Tri), florasulam (Flo) and imazamox (Ima).

743 ^c Herbicide response to ALS inhibitors. R, resistance; r, moderately resistance (re-growth) and S, susceptible. For every product, only reported
 744 responses have been represented.

745

746

747 Table 5. Correlation between observed individual response to imazamox or florasulam and individual nucleotide and amino-acid sequence of
 748 corn poppy (*Papaver rhoeas*) acetolactate synthase. Only positions related with ALS resistance (Ala122 ,Pro197, Ala205, Asp376, Trp574,
 749 Ala653 and Gly654) and those positions where mutations were found (Glu427 and Leu648) have been represented. All sequences were compared
 750 with the wild type corn poppy ALS gene (GenBank: AJ577316). In sensitive ALS corn poppy, codon 653 encodes an alanine and not a serine
 751 residue as in other species.

752

Code	Ala122	Pro197	Ala205	Asp376	Trp574	Glu427	Leu648	Ala653	Gly654	Response
Wild type ALS	GCA	CCT	GCA	GAT	TGG	GAA	TTG	GCT	GGT	--
Imazamox										
S-013 ^a (21) ^b	GCA	CCT	GCA	GAT	TGG	GAA	TTG	GCT	GGT	r
S-013 (22)	GCA	CCT	GCA	GAT	TGG	GAA	TTG	GCT	GGT	S
R-703 (24)	GCA	CCT	GCA	GAT	TGG	GAA	TTG	GCT	GGT	r
R-703 (29)	GCA	CCT	GCA	GAT	TGG	GAA	TTG	GCT	GGT	r
R-703(30)	GCA	CCT	GCA	GAT	TGG	GAA	TTG	GCT	GGT	r
R-703 (21)	GCA	CCT	GCA	GAT	TGG	GAA	TTG	GCT	GGT	S
R-114 (26)	GCA	*MYT*	GCA	GAT	TGG	*RAA*	*TYG*	GCT	GGT	R
R-114 (25)	GCA	*MYT*	GCA	GAT	TGG	*RAA*	TTG	GCT	GGT	r
Florasulam										
R-114 (20)	GCA	*ACT*	GCA	GAT	TGG	*AAA*	TTG	GCT	GGT	r
R-114 (17)	GCA	*ACT*	GCA	GAT	TGG	*AAA*	TTG	GCT	GGT	S

753

754 ^a Population code.

755 ^b Code of the sample within the population

756 * indicate mutated residue nucleotide

757

758 Table 6. Amount of imazamox and its hydroxy metabolite ($\mu\text{g}\cdot\text{g}^{-1}$ plant, $n = 3$
 759 replicates) detected by liquid chromatography–DAD in extracts of plants from one
 760 susceptible (S-013) and three resistant (R-213, R-313 and R-703) corn poppy (*Papaver*
 761 *rhoeas*) populations, evaluated at 24, 48 and 72 hours after foliar application (HAT).
 762 ND: not detected; Standard error of the mean in parenthesis.

HAT	Population	Imazamox ^a		Hydroxy metabolite	
		Aerial part	Root	Aerial part	Root
24	S-013	63.6a (2.7)	ND	ND	ND
	R-213	59.0a (1.5)	ND	ND	ND
	R-313	56.6a (0.8)	ND	ND	ND
	R-703	-*	-*	ND	ND
48	S-013	90.8a (1.9)	8.7 (0.4)	ND	ND
	R-213	66.1b (2.9)	ND	ND	ND
	R-313	65.2b (2.6)	ND	ND	ND
	R-703	59.3b (3.5)	ND	ND	ND
72	S-013	123.2a (3.45)	23.6a (1.0)	ND	ND
	R-213	91.1b (1.2)	0.9b (0.1)	ND	ND
	R-313	72.0c (1.0)	ND	19.8 (1.0)	0.9 (0.0)
	R-703	97.9b (1.7)	ND	ND	ND

763 ^a Means within a column and evaluation time followed by the same letter are not
 764 significantly different at the 5% level as determined by the Tukey test.

765 * samples lost.

766

767